

PROCEEDINGS

OF

THE COMMON COUNCIL

OF THE

CITY OF ROCHESTER.

FOR

1871-2.

3

ROCHESTER, N. Y.

DAILY EXPRESS BOOK AND JOB PRINTING HOUSE, 23 BUFFALO STREET.

1871.

mayor and treasurer, shall be payable at the office of said treasurer, not more than thirty years nor less than fifteen years from the date thereof; shall bear semi-annual interest at the rate of seven per cent. per annum; shall be duly registered in the office of said treasurer, and as fast as the moneys shall be required by said commissioners they shall be negotiated by said mayor and treasurer on the best attainable terms, but at not less than their par value; and the moneys received upon such negotiation shall be deposited with the Treasurer of said city, who shall keep a separate account thereof, and shall pay therefrom, on the order of said commissioners, from time to time, as shall be required to pay the expenditures which said commissioners are empowered by thiy act to make.

§ 8. I shall be the duty of the Common Council of said city of Rochester to cause to cause to be raised yearly, by tax upon the taxable property in the said city Rochester, in the same manner as the other general taxes are levied, a sum sufficient to pay the interest upon the said bonds when and as the same shall become due and payable, and from time to time in like manner to raise the moneys necessary to pay the principle of its said bonds as they shall fall due.

§ 9. No member of the Common Council of said city shall be eligible to the office of commissioner under this act.

§ 10. The whole amount to be expended by said commissioners under this act shall not exceed \$500,000, and they shall perform and complete all the duties assigned to them by this act within two and one-half years from the passage of this act.

Ald. McConnell presented the following:

By Alderman McConnell — Whereas, This Board has learned with surprise and regret that a bill has been introduced into the Legislature to appoint a Commission for the purpose of locating and building a City Hall for this city; therefore,

Resolved, That this Board do most earnestly protest against any such legislation as contemplated in said bill, and we request our immediate representatives to use their utmost exertions to prevent the passage of the same.

Resolved, That the Charter Amendment Committee, together with Ald. Pond, Gould and Caring, be appointed a Special Committee to take all such measures as may be necessary to prevent the passage of the bill now before the Legislature in reference to building a City Hall and that they be directed to act immediately in the matter.

Resolved, That the Clerk transmit copies of the above to our representatives immediately.

Ald. Craig offered the following as a substitute for Ald. McConnell's resolutions:

By Ald. Craig—Whereas, The city having disposed of its interest in the present Court House, and agreeable to the terms of said disposal, it will become necessary to vacate said premises in January, 1873; and

Whereas, The Common Council have from time to time endeavored to locate a site for a new City Hall, but in view of the differences existing among the members of said Common Council, it is believed that no definite result can be had so long as the matter is left to the said Common Council;

Therefore it is deemed advisable by the taxpayers at large that a commission be appointed by the Legislature to locate and build a new

City Hall, thereby relieving the said Common Council from all differences that now exist, believing it will be for the best interest of all concerned; therefore

Resolved, That a committee of five be appointed by the Chair, whose duty it shall be to go to Albany at once and procure the passage of such an act.

Ald. Glover moved the indefinite postponement of Ald. Craig's substitute.

Carried by the following vote:

Ayes—Ald. Aldridge, Gould, Rogers, Pond, Herzberger, Heavey, Fee, Caring, Stern, Glover, McConnell, Stone, Mandeville, Stape, Charters, Stebbins, Whitmore, Mauder, Stade, Parsons, Aikenhead—21.

Nays—Ald. Craig—1.

The original resolution as presented by Ald. McConnell was then adopted by the following vote:

Ayes—Ald. Aldridge, Gould, Rogers, Pond, Herzberger, Heavey, Fee, Caring, Stern, Glover, McConnell, Stone, Mandeville, Stape, Charters, Stebbins, Whitmore, Mauder, Stade, Parsons, Aikenhead—21.

Nays—Ald. Craig—1.

On motion of Ald. Rogers adjourned.

WILLIAM F. MORRISON,
City Clerk.

In Common Council, Jan. 30th, 1872.

ADJOURNED MEETING.

President, Ald. C. R. Parsons, presiding.

Present—Ald. Whitcomb, Aldridge, Wait, Rogers, Pond, Herzberger, Heavey, Caring, Connolly, Glover, McConnell, Stone, Craig, Kelly, Selye, Mandeville, Stape, Charters, Gerling, Stebbins, Whitmore, Mauder, Stade, Parsons, Aikenhead—25.

Absent—Ald. Gould, Fee, Stern—3.

REPORTS OF SPECIAL COMMITTEES.

Ald. Stone, in behalf of the Special Committee on Water Works, presented the following:

WATER WORKS—REPORT OF COMMITTEE.

To the Honorable the Common Council of the City of Rochester:

The undersigned, charged by a resolution of your honorable body, passed December 12, 1872, with "the duty of investigating the present plan to supply the city with water, and especially to examine the Holly or any other system, which shall look to bringing the water from Lake Ontario, and to present the matters in some tangible shape for the consideration of the Common Council, and a public meeting of our citizens, if they shall deem the same advisable," respectfully

REPORT

that immediately after the passage of said resolution, and without waiting for an official notification, they organized and proceeded to the work assigned them. They sought by letters of inquiry and otherwise reliable information as to the working of the Holly system in various cities, the cost of works adequate to supplying this city with water from Lake Ontario and from the Genesee river respectively; they also made such inquiry into "the present plan" as seemed necessary; and procured a new analysis of the water of the Genesee—which has caused the principal delay in the completion of their labors.

LAKE ONTARIO.

The committee have not been able to procure reliable data on which they could base an estimate of the cost, nor even the certainty, of supplying the city with Ontario water. The elements of uncertainty in the two problems are: first, the practicability of constructing a tunnel under the lake bottom far enough from the shore to secure lake water at all times untainted with the impurities of city sewage carried down by the Genesee; and, second, the cost of such tunnel, provided it can be constructed.

The committee possess no information as to the character of the lake bottom under which a tunnel would require to be made for the purpose in question. If it is sand, or anything but rock or earth substantially impervious to water, the cost would be so great as to forbid the serious consideration of this plan; and if it is such, or earth of the kind referred to, the cost would still be enormous, and probably out of all proportion to the value of the tunnel when completed. The committee, however, are not prepared to submit any estimates on this point.

It is obvious that the plan of obtaining water from Lake Ontario, must necessarily include some arrangement for taking the supply at a very considerable distance from the shore; inasmuch as the river water surcharged with impurities, derived from sewage and the various manufactories situated on its banks, would otherwise be taken up and forced back by expensive machinery for the daily use of our citizens. The cost of the works aside from the tunnel and forcing machinery, is estimated by very competent authority at something over \$70,000 per mile. That is, to supply the city with water taken from the lake near the shore would cost (reckoning the distance at eight miles) rising of \$560,000 more than it would cost to supply it with water from the river taken above all sewage and other local sources of impurity. And even to this large amount must be added another large sum for extra machinery which this plan would necessitate, as well as the indefinite cost of a tunnel should it be proposed to secure lake water unmixed with the water of the Genesee.

THE ROCHESTER WATER WORKS COMPANY.

Since this committee was appointed the property of this company has been sold under a foreclosure of one class of mortgage bonds, and has been purchased, as this committee have been informed, by Lucien Birdseye on behalf of his client, a Mr. Rand. The purchaser is represented as a gentleman of great enterprise and ample means to complete the works on any plan that may be deemed best for all interests; and Mr. Birdseye has assured the committee that he will soon be prepared to submit proposals to the Common Council for supplying the city with Hemlock lake water on the plan contemplated by the old company; and also other proposals for supplying the same waters under pressure by means of the Holly system. The committee think a respectful hearing should be accorded to Mr. Rand and that whatever offer he may submit should have a fair and candid consideration. It is understood that the contract long since made with the old company for supplying the city with water for public purposes, has lapsed; and that the city is entirely free to enter into new contracts with the present repre-

sentative of the company; or with a company to be hereafter organized; or to proceed to construct water works on public account, accordingly as one or other of these plans may seem most conducive to the general interests of our citizens. It should however be stated in this connection that there is a class of bonds amounting to some \$50,000 which, it is claimed by the holders thereof, constitute a first lien upon all the property of the company that was bought by Mr. Rand. Litigation growing out of this claim is now pending; and the committee are informed that the case will probably not be tried till next May. It would seem a very obvious dictate of prudence that an adequate guaranty against delay in consequence of this litigation should precede or form a part of any negotiation with the purchaser under the recent foreclosure, for a water supply. That litigation may last for years; and meanwhile the title to the property will be involved in some degree of uncertainty.

The committee understand—although they have sought no new information on that point—that the water which the company under former management proposed to supply is very far from being pure or even cleanly; they believe that a reliable supply of pure water from Hemlock Lake cannot be obtained excepting by substituting cast iron for the wooden mains, and extending them southwardly to the lake, or at least beyond every local source of contamination. The distance from the city to the lake is not far from twenty-eight miles; and the cost of cast iron pipe per mile is estimated by a correspondent of the Democrat, writing apparently in the interest of the late bondholders, at \$47,520. On this basis an iron main of capacity sufficient for the purpose would cost \$1,350,560. This amount of new expenditure, less by whatever sum may be saved by substituting an open ditch or raceway for iron pipe for a short distance near the lake, the committee regard as an indispensable first step towards securing a reliable supply of Hemlock Lake water.

THE HOLLY SYSTEM.

From whatever source water may be taken, the committee are decidedly and unanimously of the opinion that it should be distributed through the city by means of the Holly or some analogous system. Should the water be taken from the river or from Lake Ontario, that or a similar system of forcing would be absolutely indispensable; and should the Hemlock water be brought here by its own gravity, it could never meet the wants or answer to the expectations of the public unless it should be distributed under a pressure sufficient for fire purposes without the agency of a fire engine. The prevalent opinion that a reservoir located on the Mt. Hope range of hills would furnish sufficient head to make the water available for fire purposes by attaching hose directly to the hydrants, is, as the Committee are thoroughly convinced, entirely erroneous. During the hours of the day, when the consumption of water by private consumers is greatest, it is very evident from facts derived from the experience of other cities, that the reservoir pressure would not render the water available for fire suppression above the second stories of buildings.

The great and peculiar merit of the Holly system is, that within three or four minutes of the receipt of fire alarm it will supply a pressure

sufficient to throw a stream or streams over the highest buildings, from any hydrant connected with the works—thus entirely superseding the necessity of fire engines for the protection of property within the territory ramified by water pipes. At least one city has sold all its steam fire engines and now depends upon its Holly water works alone for protection against fire; while others have transferred their fire engines to the outer sections where pipes have not been laid. The testimony received by the Committee from many cities, is to the effect that in no case has a fire extended beyond the building in which it originated, since the introduction of the Holly works. In some localities insurance rates have been reduced twenty-five to fifty per cent. on account of their demonstrated efficiency; while in all, so far as the Committee are advised, the amount of insurance has been greatly diminished, owing to the increased sense of security which the presence of these works begets. The Hon. D. W. Iddings of Dayton, Ohio, writes: "It is the common opinion of our people—and I hear it frequently expressed—that since the inauguration of our (Holly) works, less than two years ago, they have saved enough property, which would otherwise have been destroyed by fire to pay back the entire expenditure of the city in constructing and operating them." Other testimony of the same tenor, both oral and written, has come to the committee in such abundance and so well attested as to leave no doubt in their minds that the Holly, or some similar system of water works, is imperatively necessary for this city and should be provided for with the least possible delay. They believe that it would supersede the necessity of maintaining our expensive steam fire engines as fast as the pipes and hydrants should be extended from the center towards the outskirts of the city; and that in a short time the Mayor of Rochester would be able to state the effects of its adoption in substantially the same words as Mayor Brotherson of Peoria, Ill.: "It has reduced the expenses of our fire department nearly one-half, notwithstanding that we now have a paid department and previously a volunteer one. We now use one-horse hose carriages, with three paid hose-men to each carriage, and these we find prompt and efficient."

THE HOLLY SYSTEM AND THE ALTERNATIVE SOURCES OF SUPPLY.

Should it be decided to adopt the Holly system regardless of the question whether or not to depend on the water of Hemlock Lake, ultimately, for the use of the city, there would be no risk beyond a small contingent loss, in proceeding at once to construct works on this plan and taking water from the river above the upper dam at such point as proper inquiry shall prove to be best. For fire, sewer, and all other excepting only drinking and culinary purposes, the river water is universally admitted to be just as good as the water of Hemlock Lake. And were such works now in operation, Hemlock Lake could at any future time be substituted for river water, should it be deemed desirable, with little inconvenience or loss. The machinery and the street mains would be the same in cost, strength and construction whether they should be first used for river water or held in abeyance for the use of the water from Hemlock Lake.

ESTIMATED COST OF HOLLY WORKS.

The Committee submit the following figures for the information of the Common Council and the public. They are hastily prepared on incomplete data by a gentleman thoroughly well qualified to estimate correctly on definite specifications.

Approximate estimate of cost of machinery, pipe, &c., for supplying 4,000,000 gallons of water in twenty-four hours in the city of Rochester, and of extinguishing fires if the water is taken from the river; one mile main, twenty-four inches in diameter, and one inch thick, laid and leaded.....	\$ 44,345
Twenty miles distribution, average weight, forty lbs. per foot.....	147,840
Building and foundations.....	29,000
Two hundred hydrants.....	9,000
Stop valves.....	4,000
Trenching 21 miles, 15 cents per lineal foot.....	16,632
Filter.....	1,500
Machinery.....	85,000

Total cost, if water is taken from the river one mile above the city.....\$293,317

The committee would add a considerable sum to that here given were they (as they are not) called upon to make an estimate of their own. The filter would probably cost much more than the estimate; but the location, which cannot now be even surmised, much less definitely fixed, would constitute the leading element in its cost. Besides a longer line of distributing pipe than the estimate embraces would be necessary as soon as it could be laid. And other items would probably be found somewhat too low, to meet which contingency it should be stated, the gentleman referred to proposed to add ten per cent. to the aggregate. The "machinery" is put down at the exact sum for which the Holly Company will supply it; and it includes, as the committee are advised, the requisite steam engines and boilers, three sets of pumping machinery so adjusted that in case of accident to one set another can be substituted without delay; and also a fire alarm, &c., &c.

QUALITIES OF GENESEE RIVER WATER.

The committee thought it proper to procure a new analysis of our river water, and Prof. S. A. Lattimore of the Rochester University, was accordingly employed for that purpose. He procured two samples of river water on the 29th of December—one taken from the river opposite the Valley Railroad depot, and the other at a point above the rapids. The Professor says "the river was at a low stage and covered with ice about eight inches thick. No rain had fallen for some time. Consequently, under these circumstances, while the proportion of mechanically suspended matter in the waters of the river must have been near the minimum, at the same time the proportion of lime and other salts in solution was probably near the maximum. Both samples were taken from the middle of the river."

His analysis is as follows:

	Water from Genesee river opposite G. V. depot.		Water from Genesee river above the Rapids.	
	Parts in 1,000,000	Grains per gal.	Parts in 1,000,000	Grains per gal.
Total solid matter.....	173	10.96	175	10.18
Do. after standing five days.....	150	8.75	154	8.98
Do. after standing ten days.....	150	8.75	154	8.98
ANALYSIS OF SOLID MATTER.				
Clay, &c., insoluble in acids.....	24	1.40	31	1.59

Carbonate and sulphate of lime.....	118	6.87	112	6.47
Carbonate of magnesia.....	20	1.17	20	1.17
Oxide of iron.....	2	.12	2	.12
Chloride of sodium	6	.40	3	.20
Silica — not determined.....				
Organic matter.....		Traces		Traces

Prof. Lattimore states that another examination for solid matter after the water had stood 10 days gave the same results as were obtained at the end of five days—a fact which shows that all matter mechanically suspended was deposited within that period.

The significance of the figures of this analysis—so far as the members of the committee are concerned, and the same is doubtless true of the community generally—depends entirely upon a comparison of them with figures representing the analysis of other waters. The report of Engineer Marsh, made in 1860, to the authorities of this city, and embodied in a prospectus for the sale of Rochester Water Works bonds issued in 1870, furnished ample means for making such comparison. The number of grains of solid matter to the gallon of different waters is here given on that authority: Croton, (by B. Silliman, sr., highest authority,) 10.93; average of Croton analysis, 7.26; average of Schuylkill, 5.03; Cochituate, 3.45; Ottawa and St. Lawrence, 7.04; cistern water soon after rain, 6.40; average wells of Rochester, 28.33; Manhattan wells (largely used in New York before Croton,) 125.00; Caledonia spring, 44.80; Erie Canal at Rochester, 1862, 8.00; Honeoye outlet at Smithtown, 1853, 4.31; Lake Ontario in front of piers one-half mile out, 10.00; northeast of piers and beyond the stream discharged from Genesee River, 6.40; west of piers, 4.16; Genesee River at high water in 1860, 6.40; high water in August, 1860, 5.60; at Rapids, (time not stated) 11.21.

Thus it will be seen that our river water compares favorably with many other waters which are freely used and highly esteemed by the people of the various localities named. Croton contains 10.93 grains of solid matter according to the very highest American authority; while Genesee contains from 5.60 to 11.21 grains—the amount varying with the stage of water. The well at the old Cornhill tavern in our city showed 41.00 grains solid matter to the gallon. Its elevation above the surrounding territory excludes the idea of other than mineral solids—probably carbonate of lime chiefly; while the river water contains but 6.87 grains of lime to the gallon, or only one-sixth as much as the water of this far-famed well. And as for other foreign substances, the committee neither know nor can conceive of any reason for supposing that the water of the Genesee is not quite as free from them, as the water from other rivers from which different cities in different parts of the country respectively draw their supplies. It is not, like the Ohio and other rivers (the waters of which are used without filtering by many cities on their banks) contaminated by the sewage of large towns. Its sources are mostly springs and small streams taking their rise in lakelets of clear water; and so far as the committee are advised no large swamps filled with decayed vegetable matter has the Genesee for its outlet. The few local causes of contamination indicated by the excess of chloride of sodium (itself a small quantity) found in the sample of water taken

near the Valley Depot, can be easily removed; doubtless other causes of like character along the river and its tributaries, which affect our imaginations more than the purity of the water at a great distance, could readily be disposed of; and then the only valid objection to the water would necessarily rest upon the few grains of salts of lime to the gallon which it unquestionably contains. Yet in spite of these facts, and it would seem for some purpose not altogether in harmony with public interests—a determined effort has been made which is still resolutely persisted in, to make our citizens believe that the water of the Genesee is totally and irredeemably unfit for general use; and that no other than Hemlock Lake water should be accepted. Even while this report is in progress, a letter has been received from the engineer of the "gold bondholders of the Rochester Water Works" alleging that the Hemlock Lake project is the only one worthy of consideration, soliciting our citizens our citizens to aid in raising \$150,000 of the \$410,000, which he says would complete the works and assure an annual revenue of not less than \$180,000, at an expense of only \$10,000; but he takes pains to impart this precious bit of information:

"I have understood that there are some persons who propose to secure a water supply by pumping from the river or lake; but the supply would be surcharged with lime and entirely unfit for culinary or manufacturing purposes."

The average of wells in Rochester, as shown by Mr. Marsh, the former engineer of the company, contains 28.33 grains of solid matter—mostly lime—to the gallon; the Genesee water contains 10.06 to 10.18 grains of solid matter to the gallon, of which less than 7.00 grains is lime. Yet the engineer above quoted tells a people who have all their lives used well water (as many of our citizens do) containing 28.33 grains of solid matter to the gallon, that river water containing ten grains and lake water containing a much smaller quantity of solid matter are "surcharged with lime and entirely unfit for culinary purposes!"

It may not be unprofitable to enquire a little further into this lime question and see whether the authority of the "engineer of the gold bond holders of the Rochester water works" should be accepted as conclusive as to "unfitness" of our river water "for culinary purposes." Charles F. Chandler delivered a very elaborate and exhaustive lecture on water before the American Institute in January, 1871, in which he sets forth the conclusions in respect to the sanitary effects of waters of various qualities, at which men of science have arrived after long and patient investigation. He says: "The sanitary Congress which met at Brussels decided that water containing more than thirty-five grains of impurity in one gallon is not wholesome, and that there should not be much more than one grain of organic matter." Genesee water is very far removed from these objections. He says further: "It is a great advantage in making tea or coffee to use water of about five degrees of hardness; that is, containing about five grains of carbonate of lime or its equivalent in the gallon." Hence it is clear that Genesee water has a "great advantage in making tea or coffee," over any other that is proposed for supplying the city.

But by far the most important fact bearing directly upon the subject before this committee,

stated by Mr. Chandler in his lecture, is the following:

"Dr. Lethby, one of the highest authorities on the sanitary relations of water, considers water of moderate hardness preferable to very soft water, for domestic purposes. About six grains of carbonate of lime to the gallon is desirable. He finds the death rate is less in cities supplied with moderately hard water than in those supplied with soft water."

The Genesee water exactly fulfills these conditions; that is, when "the proportion of lime is near the maximum" (at low water) to quote the language of Professor Lattimore, it contains 6.87 grains of lime to the gallon. When the water is high, the lime would be proportionally less; but at all times it would be "about six grains of carbonate of lime to the gallon," a proportion which one of the highest authorities on the sanitary relations of water considers as a condition of good health and a low death rate.

It has long been held by many men of high intelligence that water containing a moderate proportion of lime is better adapted to the constructive processes of nature which are always going on in the human organism, than water in which that element is wanting. That opinion is now fortified, if not conclusively established, by an accurate observer and painstaking statistician, who is also a medical expert, and it will not be shaken in the estimation of intelligent men by the vague and sweeping aspersion of an engineer whose principal concern is (very properly) to rescue his employers from a disastrous financial adventure.

WATER RIGHTS—POWER—LOCATION.

A long standing objection to taking water from the river, is that it would involve the paying of an indemnity to the owners of water power at this point; and it was assumed that this indemnity would require a large sum—inasmuch as a full supply for the city would take nearly all the water of the river at its lower stages! The committee are advised by eminent counsel and it is the dictate of common sense, that the mill owners, would be entitled to no larger sum, if the water be taken from the river here, than if it were taken from one of its tributaries. And the matter of indemnity ceases to be formidable when submitted to a mathematical test. The quantity of water represented by 4,000,000 gallons per day is found by accurate calculation to be considerably less than is required at sixteen feet head to run one run of stone and its accompanying machinery. The cost of the water right could not, therefore, be heavy.

It is probable that any company (or the city as the case may be) that should undertake to supply the city with water by means of the Holly or other similar system would find it advantageous to buy a water power on one of the upper races. The ownership of such power would give a company all the water it would need for distribution, and also supersede the necessity of steam machinery, except as a reserve power for forcing purposes. Moreover, if at any future time it should be deemed expedient to substitute Hemlock or Honeoye, for river water, the same forcing power could be used, while the water hitherto distributed, and any surplus that should remain, would constitute a valuable property which could readily be sold, or applied to "manufacturing purposes."

An engineer who has had much experience with the Holly system gives a decided preference for water over steam power for forcing purposes. He states also that a filter of a kind and capacity that will give the city a full supply of river water rendered free from all impurities that are mechanically mixed with it, can be constructed at a moderate cost.

The committee having to the best of their ability, discharged the duty assigned them, will very briefly restate the conclusions to which candid and impartial investigation has led them:

First—That from whatever source the supply of water be taken, it should be distributed by the forcing system; inasmuch as that system will enable private consumers to draw water at any elevation; and that it will very largely diminish the cost of the fire department and at the same time increase its efficiency in a still greater proportion.

Second—That the cost of getting water from a point in Lake Ontario, which the Genesee water contaminated by the sewage of the city rarely or never reaches, would be so great as to render the attempt inexpedient.

Third—That the Hemlock Lake project is at present in such a state of disorganization and uncertainty that no reliance can be placed upon it; since the engineer of the works, so recently as the 20th inst., intimated that their completion is contingent upon the help of Rochester capitalists in raising \$150,000 within a month, on a basis not stated to them, unknown.

Fourth—That in case the water of Hemlock Lake should be brought here in wooden or sheet iron pipe, the city supply will be more liable to interruption than it will be if taken from the river, by the full extent of the liability to accident of a frail line of pipe many miles in length.

Fifth—That the cheapest, most expeditious, and most reliable supply can be procured by taking water from the river within or near the city limits; and finally,

Sixth—That the water of the Genesee, properly protected from contaminating influences, and filtered, will prove to be as wholesome as any city on the continent is supplied with.

All of which is respectfully submitted.

Rochester, Jan. 24, 1872.

ISAAC BUTTS, Chairman.
JOHN H. BREWSTER, Sec'y.
P. BARRY.
HENRY CHURCHILL.
WM. N. SAGE.
GEORGE G. COOPER.
D. W. POWERS.
WM. S. THOMPSON.
H. B. KNAPP.
THOMAS PARSONS.

Ordered received, filed and published.

Ald. Stone moved the adoption of the act to authorize the city of Rochester to subscribe for the stock of the Lake Ontario Shore Railroad Company from the proceeds of the sale of the Rochester and Genesee Valley Railroad Company stock owned by said city (at folio 283 of printed proceedings.)

Ald. Selye moved to table until the next regular meeting.

Lost by the following vote:

Ayes—Ald. Whitcomb, Aldridge, Caring, Selye, Stape, Charters, Mauder, Stade—8.

Nays—Ald. Wait, Rogers, Pond, Herzberger, Heavey, Connolly, Glover, McConnell, Stone,